

**Meeting of the Advisory Committee of the  
Valley Clean Energy Alliance (VCEA)  
November 6, 2017  
5:30 PM**

Woodland Senior & Community Center – Room #4, 2001 East Street, Woodland, 95778

Meetings are accessible to people with disabilities. Individuals who need special assistance or a disability-related modification or accommodation to participate in this meeting, or who have a disability and wish to request an alternative format for the meeting materials, should contact Mitch Sears, VCEA Interim General Manager, at least 2 working days before the meeting at (530) 757-5610 or msears@cityofdavis.org.

If you have anything that you wish to be distributed to the Advisory Committee and included in the official record, please hand it to a member of VCEA staff who will distribute the information to the Committee members and other staff.

**Committee Members:**

Mark Aulman, Marsha Baird, Amanda Beck, Gerry Braun, Tom Flynn, Yvonne Hunter, Lorenzo Kristov, Christine Shewmaker, David Springer

**5:30 PM CALL TO ORDER**

- 1. Welcome and Roll Call**
- 2. Approval of Agenda**
- 3. Public Comment**

This item is reserved for persons wishing to address the Committee on any VCEA-related matters that are not otherwise on this meeting agenda. Public comments on matters listed on the agenda shall be heard at the time the matter is called. As with all public comment, members of the public who wish to address the Committee are customarily limited to two minutes per speaker, but an extension can be provided at the discretion of the Chair.

**4. Committee Member, Staff, Board Announcements**

Representatives of VCEA staff and active sub-committees may request time to provide updates on on-going work. Sub-committee recommendations requiring Committee attention require a regular agenda item. Summaries of written reports received by the committee in advance of the meeting will receive a time allocation of up to ten minutes. Otherwised, the time allocation will be five minutes, including questions and answers. The committee may decide to allocate additional time at the end of the regular agenda.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

- 5. Approval of Minutes from September 27, 2017 Committee Meeting**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

- 6. Action. Consider Adoption of Community Advisory Committee Long Range Calendar/ Work Plan. The purpose of the Calendar/Work Plan is to plan future agenda items based on topics to be covered at upcoming VCEA Board meetings. (25 minutes)**

- 7. Action. Launch Phase Outreach Task Group Recommendation on Draft Valley Clean Energy Alliance Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan. (30 minutes)**
- 8. Action. Consider feedback on draft VCEA Vision Statement. Revise draft Vision Statement if necessary and recommend Board adoption. (10 minutes)**
- 9. Review. Consider updated Load Forecasts, Procurement Approach, and final submitted Implementation Plan. (30 minutes)**
- 10. Presentation. Introduction of draft Energy Trading and Risk Management Policy. (15 minutes)**
- 11. Long Range Calendar, Meeting Schedule, Next Meeting Agenda (5 minutes)**
- 12. Adjournment (Approximately 7:30pm)**

Public records that relate to any item on the agenda for a regular Committee meeting are available for public inspection. Those records that are distributed less than 72 hours prior to the meeting are available for public inspection at the same time they are distributed to all members, or a majority of the members of the Committee. Until VCEA has offices, the Board has designated the Department of Community Development and Sustainability at the City of Davis located at 23 Russell Blvd, Davis, CA for the purpose of making those public records available for inspection. The documents are also available on the City of Davis website located at: <http://cityofdavis.org/city-hall/commissions-and-committees/valley-clean-energy-alliance>.

**MINUTES OF THE VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE**  
**Advisory Committee Meeting**  
**September 27, 2017**

The meeting of the Advisory Committee (AC) of the Valley Clean Energy Alliance (VCEA) began at 5:30pm in the Davis Senior Center, Activities Room, 646 A Street, Davis, CA.

**Committee Members Present:** Mark Aulman, Marsha Baird, Gerry Braun, Tom Flynn, Yvonne Hunter, Lorenzo Kristov, Christine Shewmaker.

**Committee Members Absent:** Amanda Beck, David Springer.

**Staff Members Present:** Emily Henderson, Mitch Sears.

**Public Present:** Richard McCann.

**SMUD Consultants Present:** Michael Champ, Gary Lawson.

1. Welcome and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 5:30pm.

2. Approval of Agenda

M. Aulman moved, T. Flynn seconded approval of meeting agenda. Approved unanimously.

3. Public Comment

Richard McCann reminded the committee that VCEA is not just buying power, but managing energy. Agricultural interests in the area have been ignored by PG & E and it is an opportunity for VCEA to address their needs. Monterey is another CCE with Ag interests that VCEA could learn from.

4. VCEA Staff and Advisory Sub-Committee Reports

- **Staff:** Briefings by SMUD and Circlepoint (via phone) are regular agenda items for this meeting.
- **Vision sub-committee:** Draft Vision Statement is regular agenda item for this meeting.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

5. Approval of Minutes from September 11, 2017 Committee Meeting

C. Shewmaker submitted comments to staff that have been incorporated in Minutes: “KD Power” corrected to “Arcadia Power” in Item 3 and “contract” corrected to “certified implementation plan” in Item 9.

C. Shewmaker moved, M. Baird seconded approval of Minutes with corrections. Approved with one abstention.

6. Approval of Appointment of SMUD Agreement Task Group.

G. Braun proposed appointing a SMUD Agreement Task Group consisting of T. Flynn, L. Kristov, and D. Springer. The proposed SMUD Services Contract will be presented at the October 12<sup>th</sup> VCEA Board Meeting for approval. L. Kristov commented that he will be traveling quite a bit in the coming weeks. Y. Hunter offered to be a fourth member of the Task Group. C. Shewmaker moved and G.

Braun seconded the appointment of the Task Group. Committee members approved unanimously. M. Sears will send draft of SMUD Services Contract to Task Group.

## REGULAR AGENDA

### 7. Discussion. Draft VCEA Vision Statement.

L. Kristov provided background on the Vision Statement. In 2015, the Citizens Advisory Committee in Davis prepared a Vision Statement and sent it to the City Council as a starting point for discussions on a CCE. The City Council approved the Davis vision statement. The Davis statement was adapted for VCEA to incorporate multiple jurisdictions and additional plans.

C. Shewmaker recommended adding to second bullet in the long-term vision a goal of 100% renewable or zero carbon emissions. Others agreed. Y. Hunter recommended removing “within Yolo County” from last bullet. Additionally, M. Sears suggested changing “Davis, Woodland and Yolo County” to “VCEA customers” in long-term vision. Members agreed. L. Kristov incorporated these comments.

G. Braun will present Vision Statement draft to VCEA Board on October 12<sup>th</sup> and ask for comments and inputs before bringing the final version to them for approval at November 9<sup>th</sup> Board meeting.

### 8. Information. Implementation Plan and Launch Schedule Update.

M. Sears explained that tonight’s presentation from SMUD would focus on the work they are doing modeling the renewable energy content, which will be included in the Implementation Plan. Gary Lawson and Michael Champ from SMUD presented the slides which included 3 potential portfolios and three rate structure options.

Several committee members commented that it is important for Staff to advise the Board that the Implementation Plan is a regulatory requirement, not a business plan. Further, it was recommended that SMUD (and Staff) clarify that further analysis and work on the portfolio mix and rate structure will occur in the future.

G. Braun asked if it was possible to get learnings from other CCAs regarding the reserve policy. C. Shewmaker also felt it would be helpful to have a chart showing what portfolio mix and rates other CCAs are using today.

L. Kristov commented that although the Implementation Plan is a formality, it will influence perceptions. The Board will want to be conservative and prudent – under promise and over deliver.

M. Sears explained that SMUD will be presenting 3 portfolio mix options and 3 rate options to the Board on October 12<sup>th</sup>. Staff will have a recommendation on which portfolio mix and rate option should be included in the Implementation Plan. The goal is to submit the Implementation Plan in mid-October.

Several committee members proposed an alternative option – A’, changing from 100% clean to 75%, as a possible option to present to the Board.

G. Braun expressed concern over the limited time the Advisory Committee had to review the information and would like to do things differently in the future. He felt it is not reasonable to create the expectation on the Board’s part that the AC can make recommendations without more time with the data. In the future, having the materials prior to the meeting would allow time for AC members to review.

The committee discussed what should be reported to the Board. While no motions were made or votes taken, the basic sense is:

- The committee is not making any recommendations at this time. The information on energy mix and rate was just supplied to AC at 9/27 meeting.

- The committee will provide some general feedback to the Board:
  - The implementation plan is not set in stone – it is flexible. Important that Board and community knows this. Will be further input and changes as go forward.
  - The majority seemed to think it was a good idea to avoid PCC-3s.
  - The impact of using significant clean energy (large hydro) on whole CA /N CA grid as relates to GHG emissions was discussed and should be considered in selecting portfolio mix.
  - It will be important to pay attention to reserves.
  - The implementation plan is a public document.
  - It will be important to compare to what other CCA have done and are doing.

M. Sears explained that tonight’s presentation was to introduce the modeling SMUD is doing as a precursor to more in-depth discussions in the future.

9. Discussion. Workplan Development/Appointment of Task Groups.

G. Braun proposed that the Advisory Committee set up task groups to work on upcoming issues.

It was also discussed that the Advisory Committee could get caught up on many issues by having a half-day workshop with break-outs for sub-committees. Reactions were positive to this idea, but it would take some work and time to put together. M. Baird, G. Braun and Y. Hunter will meet to discuss options for additional task groups and a potential workshop and bring ideas to next meeting.

M. Sears shared slides that were presented at the last Board meeting with a list of topics for upcoming Board and AC meetings. For the next AC meeting, a review of Load Forecasts and Outreach Materials is planned (the slides will be attached to these minutes).

A Launch Phase Outreach task group was proposed to work with Circlepoint. M. Aulman, M. Baird and Y. Hunter volunteered for it. A. Beck was recommended to participate as well.

A Launch Phase Energy Issues task group was also recommended with G. Braun, T. Flynn, L. Kristov and D. Springer as members.

Y. Hunter and C. Shewmaker volunteered to convene a Legislative/Regulatory task group as and when future issues arise.

T. Flynn made a motion to approve the creation of these 3 sub-committees/task groups. G. Braun seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

10. Information. Outreach Update and Logo Options.

M. Sears presented Circlepoint’s slides with an update on the Outreach plans that were presented to the Board. In addition, the slides showed several product logo options.

A couple of Committee members commented that they did not like the plug in the VCE logo, while others felt it expressed the essence of the brand. For the product logos, there was some negative comments about VCE in the product name – looks like vice. Utilization of the words ‘plus’ and ‘total’ were seen as confusing. Some liked Power and PowerUp while others did not. The words and colors of Option 2 resonated with most, though the term “light” had some negative comments.

Y. Hunter made a motion to give the feedback to Circlepoint that Option 2 was headed in the right general direction. M. Aulman seconded. Motion passed with 2 abstentions.

11. Long Range Calendar, Meeting Schedule and Next Meeting Agenda.

- Next meeting agenda will include:
  - Long Range Calendar/Work Plan - plan agenda items on future meetings based on topics to be covered at upcoming Board meetings. This is to be covered first on the regular agenda.
  - Review of any feedback from Board on draft Vision and finalization of Vision Statement.

- Discussion of Load Forecast by Launch Phase Energy Issues sub-committee and SMUD.
- Discussion of Outreach Materials by Launch Phase Outreach sub-committee and Circlepoint.
- Additional topics as needed based on October 12<sup>th</sup> VCEA Board meeting.
- Next meeting will be on Monday, October 30<sup>th</sup> at 5:30pm in Woodland.
- Advisory Committee plans to meet on first Monday (or Monday 10 days before Board meetings) going forward, e.g. Dec 4<sup>th</sup>

12. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 8:00pm. Y. Hunter moved, C. Shewmaker seconded. Approved unanimously.

**ACTION ITEMS from Meeting:**

- **Mitch Sears** will send out draft of SMUD Agreement to Task Group (Flynn, Hunter, Kristov, Springer).
- **Gerry Braun** will present draft Vision Statement at Board Meeting on October 12<sup>th</sup>.
- **Marsha Baird, Gerry Braun and Yvonne Hunter** will meet to discuss Work Plan, options for additional task groups and a potential workshop and bring ideas to next meeting.

**Next Meeting: Monday, October 30, 2017 at 5:30pm in Woodland.**

# VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE

## Staff Report Item - 6

---

**TO:** VCEA Community Advisory Committee

**FROM:** Mitch Sears, Interim General Manager, VCEA  
Emily Henderson, Administrative Assistant, VCEA

**SUBJECT:** Advisory Committee Long Range Calendar/ Work Plan

**DATE:** November 6, 2017

---

### **Recommendation**

Approve the proposed Long Range Calendar / Work Plan

### **Analysis and Discussion**

The purpose of the Long Range Calendar/Work Plan is to plan future agenda items based on topics to be covered at upcoming VCEA Board meetings.

### **Meeting Dates & Locations**

On September 20, the VCEA Board adopted a regular meeting schedule to meet on the 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of each month for the rest of 2017 and 2018. To facilitate effective coordination between the Community Advisory Committee (CAC), and the VCEA Board, staff recommends the schedule below, in which the CAC would meet on monthly on Monday evenings at 5:30pm, generally 10 days prior to the VCEA Board meetings. Staff proposes that the Advisory Committee rotate between one Woodland meeting location and one Davis meeting location:

- Davis Senior Center - Activity Room: 646 A Street, Davis CA 95616
- Woodland Community & Senior Center: 2001 East Street, Woodland, CA 95776

### **Attachment**

1. CAC Long Range Calendar/Work Plan

**VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE**  
**Advisory Committee**

**2017-8 Advisory Committee and Board Meeting Dates and Topics**

MEETING DATE		TOPICS	ACTION	LOCATION
November 6, 2017	Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Long Range Calendar/Work Plan</li> <li>• Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan</li> <li>• Vision Statement</li> <li>• Load Forecast, Implementation Plan, Procurement Approach</li> <li>• Energy Trading and Risk Management Policy</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review</li> <li>• Recommend*</li> <li>• Update</li> <li>• Review</li> <li>• Presentation</li> </ul>	Woodland
November 16, 2017	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Load Forecasts/Procurement Approach</li> <li>• Introduction - Energy Trading and Risk Policies</li> <li>• Customer and Data Services Pre-Launch Activity</li> <li>• Outreach Plan</li> <li>• Outreach Materials (e.g. web site)</li> <li>• Wholesale Energy Risk and Trading Policies</li> <li>• Discussion re: VCEA Bylaws or Policies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Review</li> <li>• Review</li> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Review</li> </ul>	Woodland BOS Chambers
November 27, 2017	Advisory Committee – On Call	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Power Mix Targets</li> <li>• Reserve Policy</li> <li>• Wholesale Energy Risk and Trading Policies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review, refer to sub-group</li> <li>• Review, refer to sub-group</li> <li>• Review, refer to sub-group</li> </ul>	Davis
December 4, 2017	Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reserve Policy</li> <li>• Energy Trading/Risk Management Policies</li> <li>• Power Mix Targets</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recommend*</li> <li>• Recommend*</li> <li>• Recommend*</li> </ul>	Davis
December 14, 2017	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discuss Power Mix Targets</li> <li>• Financials/Adopt Reserve Policy – Review</li> <li>• Target Rates for FY 2018-2019 – Approve</li> <li>• Energy Trading and Risk Mgmt Policies – Approve</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Review</li> <li>• Approve</li> <li>• Approve</li> </ul>	Davis Community Chambers
January 1, 2018	SMUD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Begin power procurements</li> </ul>		



January 8, 2018	Advisory Committee			Woodland
January 11, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Review remaining Agency policies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Review</li> </ul>	Woodland BOS Chambers
January 29, 2018	Advisory Committee			Davis
February 8, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approve final power mix</li> <li>Approve remaining Agency policies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approve</li> <li>Approve</li> </ul>	Davis Community Chambers
February 26, 2018	Advisory Committee			Woodland
March 8, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>FY 2018-2019 Budget</li> <li>Final Rate Approval</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approve</li> <li>Approve</li> </ul>	Woodland BOS Chambers
April 2, 2018	Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Davis
April 12, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Davis Community Chambers
April 30, 2018	Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Woodland
May 10, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Woodland BOS Chambers
June 4, 2018	Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Davis
June 14, 2018	Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>	Davis Community Chambers

## VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE

### Staff Report Item - 7

---

**TO:** VCEA Community Advisory Committee

**FROM:** Mitch Sears, Interim General Manager, VCEA

**SUBJECT:** Launch Phase Outreach Task Group Recommendation on Draft VCEA Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan

**DATE:** November 6, 2017

---

#### **Recommendation**

Recommend VCEA Board approval of the Draft VCEA Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan.

#### **Background**

Circlepoint staff attended the September 11 Community Advisory Committee (CAC) meeting and provided an overview of the draft VCEA Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan. Staff and Circlepoint presented the outline at the October 12 VCEA Board meeting and received Board input. The Outreach Subcommittee (Mark Aulman, Marsha Baird, Yvonne Hunter) reviewed the Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan and offered comments to Staff. Responses to the Outreach Subcommittee comments are included as an attachment to this report. As noted in the responses, a majority of the comments have been incorporated into the recommended draft Plan which is also attached.

One key aspect of the plan that Staff would highlight involves stakeholder outreach to specific community groups (see the table of groups on page 14 of the attached draft Plan). The Subcommittee brainstormed additional groups, and suggested that the full Committee may have even more groups to add to the list. In order to engage all of the proposed community groups, VCEA will need the volunteer support of VCEA advocates and brand champions. A VCEA Advocate Training Workshop for volunteers and the CAC is being planned. Staff will provide additional information as details of the Workshop are developed.

Staff is seeking final CAC feedback on the draft Plan prior to the presentation of the draft to the Board for their consideration at the November 16 VCEA Board meeting.

#### **Attachments**

1. Responses to Subcommittee comments
2. Draft Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan

**REVIEW AND COMMENTS ON CIRCLEPOINT'S VCEA STRATEGIC MARKETING AND  
COMMUNICATIONS PLAN, DRAFT v3**

**VCEA Advisory Committee Outreach Subcommittee**

**Introduction.** The VCEA Advisory Committee's Outreach Subcommittee met on October 17, 2017 to discuss the draft Circlepoint Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan (referred to as Outreach Plan or Plan in this document). The following summary reflects the comments and suggestions from that meeting. They are not listed in order of priority or importance.

**NOTE: Responses in underline.**

**Staff/Circlepoint have reviewed the Outreach Subcommittee's comments on the Strategic Marketing and Communications. We appreciated the thoroughness and thoughtfulness with which they reviewed the draft document and have provided the below responses in underline outlining how we plan to integrate their insights into the VCE communications program.**

**General Observation.** We recognize that the draft Plan reflects a broad level of strategic outreach and activities. We also recognize that the draft Plan may not include intended detailed implementation strategies or activities. Thus, some of our suggestions and/or comments may already be contemplated by Circlepoint. We appreciate that the Plan is considered a living document that can be updated as new information arises and experience dictates.

1. The Plan continuously refers to "Yolo County" or "within Yolo County." We do not think this is advisable, nor does it accurately describe the VCEA membership. The references need to be clarified to reflect instead the members of VCEA (the cities of Davis and Woodland and unincorporated Yolo County). Also, if VCEA eventually includes members outside of Yolo County, the reference would be incorrect.
  - **This distinction is important. We will update the plan accordingly and will refer to our audience this way in public-facing materials as well. We will also refer to the members of VCE as "member communities" or "customers" and the VCE geography as the "service area", as other CCEs do.**
2. The Plan does not seem to reflect the need to understand and develop distinct messaging for the diverse cultures and audiences within the three member jurisdictions. While all three member agencies have enthusiastically agreed to form VCEA, each has distinct social, political and cultural differences. What may resonate in Davis may not resonate in Woodland, and what may resonate in unincorporated Yolo County may not work as well in Woodland or Davis.
  - **The plan segments VCE messaging by customer demographics and customer classes. We didn't develop city-specific messaging but it's something we can explore based on this feedback.**

3. While it is great that the Plan understands the need to have special outreach to the ag community in unincorporated Yolo County, there needs also to be an understanding and appropriate messaging that reflects where VCEA services may *not* make sense for an ag customer or large industrial and commercial customers in Woodland and/or unincorporated Yolo County. This may be due to existing direct access arrangements or special PG&E rates, such as time of use or interruptible rates that VCEA may not also adopt. This is similar to what Lancaster did for some of its industrial customers.
  - **The tailored materials we're creating for this audience include messaging about direct access arrangements and rate structures. We will communicate about the potential concerns of and potential barriers for this audience, while emphasizing the benefits that align with their unique needs and motivations.**
  
4. For non-English speaking customers, the Plan needs to include information for those other than Spanish-speakers. The Plan should also reflect that some non-English speaking (or limited English speaking) customers may have limited reading abilities (in their native language). Thus, outreach activities through ethnic radio should be planned, as well as through community groups that interact with non-English speaking residents and businesses.
  - **The plan outlines the development of tailored marketing and outreach materials for non-English speaking customers, including the creation of culturally appropriate messaging in-language that will resonate with each audience. We will update this to be more specific about the outreach activities planned to reach non-English speaking customers other than Spanish-speakers, including customers who may have limited reading abilities in their native language.**
  
5. On page 11 of the draft Plan it lists groups with which VCEA may engage. We suggest other groups in each member jurisdictions with whom to engage and/or outreach to include the following. The full Advisory Committee also can brainstorm about others groups as well.
  - Local environmental groups (i.e., Davis, Woodland Sierra Club; Cool Davis, Audubon)
  - Soroptomists
  - Farm Circle
  - PTAs in all jurisdictions
  - Yolo Energy Watch and participating groups
  - Local apartment associations
  - Local realtor's associations
  - Senior citizen organizations
  - Mobile home associations (both coach owners if they pay electricity and/or park owners for master metered parks)
  - Clergy and congregations, including ecumenical and inter-faith groups
  - Hospitals
  - School districts (not only board members, but school administrators)

- Public and private water districts and/or other government agencies located within the members of VCEA (who would receive service from VCEA and could opt out)
  - ASUCD students who pay their own utility bills (i.e., rent homes)
    - **These groups are valuable additions. In order to engage all of these groups in addition to the organizations listed in the plan, we'll need the volunteer support of VCE advocates and brand champions. The CAC will be included in the upcoming Adocate Training Workshop.**
6. A specific outreach plan should be envisioned for the Yolo County Farm Bureau – not just education materials about VCEA but outreach to engage the ag community early in the process to understand their unique needs and concerns as rates and other issues are developed. There may be other organizations that include ag members, such as cattlemen's associations, organic farmers and small farm operations that could provide input and be interested in learning about VCEA.
    - **We are engaging the Yolo County Farm Bureau to help inform our outreach strategies for the ag community and will update our plan based on their recommendations. In addition, we will look into and reach out to the additional organizations, as suggested.**
  7. The same point applies to local chambers of commerce and downtown business associations in each of the member jurisdictions. Similarly, Hispanic business associations, offer another opportunity to engage the business communities.
    - **The chambers of commerce, downtown business associations, and Hispanic business associations are already included in the plan as key organizations to engage in order to reach the business communities.**
  8. Engaging clergy and congregations (through various inter-faith associations in the three member jurisdictions) provides an opportunity to reach opinion leaders and help provide information about VCEA programs to congregation membership.
    - **Engaging faith-based organizations will be part of our grassroots engagement activities. Per our plan, we intend to reach out to religious and social-service institutions to reach target audiences through trusted channels.**
  9. Testimonials from opinion leaders in all three jurisdictions, from all sorts of different stakeholder groups, offer a good way to provide positive messaging about VCEA and hopefully answer questions residents and businesses may have about the program.
    - **This is a great idea. Please let us know if you have specific opinion leaders in mind for each of the three jurisdictions. We are also collecting testimonials from our photo shoot participants that we will be able to use on materials.**
  10. What, if any, is SMUD's role in outreach activities by Circlepoint? SMUD's expertise in market analysis for VCEA's service territory can be very important. (We notice this is

mentioned in passing in the Plan, but we want to emphasize that we believe this is important.)

- **Circlepoint and SMUD have regular calls regarding where our work products intersect, such as the enrollment forms on the website, the customer call center, and the customer notices. SMUD hasn't done market research within the VCE service territory, but their key account reps are a resource to Circlepoint. Thusfar, they have provided input on messaging and draft materials tailored to the ag community and have offered to review messaging and draft materials for other market segments as well.**

11. In planning the outreach activities, it is important to do so to a wider range of groups than just the ag community. We assume that Circlepoint intends to do so, but the Plan seems light on this. We agree with the importance to engage the ag community; however, we recognize that other groups important to the success of VCEA also need special engagement.

- **The Stakeholder Outreach section of the plan outlines the planned outreach activities of the program. Please let us know if there are other groups that need to be added (beyond what you've included in your responses here) or that need special engagement beyond the presentations and outreach outlined in the plan.**

12. It is important to develop a strategy to work with different stakeholder groups to learn early on what is important to them relative to rates. For example, this could include rate structures for large industrial users, rates for existing solar customers, water users, etc. If the VCEA plan is to ultimately adopt a rate structure that mirrors PG&E's rate structure, that needs to be communicated to existing users. If the rates adopted are different that is important too. And, it may be useful to find out from these groups if there are changes that they would like to see to PG&E rate structures that perhaps VCEA could address.

- **SMUD is working with VCEA staff to determine their recommendations regarding the rate structure. The Yolo County Farm Bureau provided their initial feedback on this topic. As the rate structure details are finalized, Circlepoint will develop messaging regarding the VCE rate structure and how that may impact different customer segments.**

13. How does VCEA impact existing direct access customers? Are they automatically included as customers (who might want to opt-out)? Are they able to switch their contracts to VCEA in the future? Messaging needs to be developed for these customers. (Existing law and regulations cover this, but we wanted to raise it as an observation.)

- **Direct access customers remain direct access customers, so nothing changes with their account. We have created an FAQ related to this for the website and relevant collateral.**

14. By engaging different stakeholders and customers early in the process, VCEA can be prepared to respond to future issues that may be of concern to those stakeholders.

- **Agreed.**
15. It may be useful to explore opportunities for co-branding with stakeholders or customers such as future solar customers/companies, businesses whose own marketing and advertising messages may be enhanced by informing their customers of their use of clean energy provided by VCEA.
    - **Please let us know more about what you have in mind for co-branding. The plan doesn't limit opportunities from happening, if such opportunities arise and are deemed beneficial by VCEA staff and the Board.**
  16. It is important to have messaging related to VCEA's intent to foster and promote local economic development through support of local solar and alternative energy sources.
    - **Yes, this messaging will appear on the website, relevant collateral, and outreach talking points.**
  17. We need to be prepared to offer factual and clear responses to criticisms of VCEA based on incorrect information or other reasons that may arise from different sources.
    - **Yes, this messaging will appear on talking points for anyone representing Valley Clean Energy (e.g. staff, Board Members, advocates).**
  18. We need to be very clear about what is meant by 1% or 3% cost savings (or less than PG&E). That is, we need to be clear that any such reference to savings pertains to generation costs *only* and not the entire bill. We also need to explain that PG&E still charges for its services.
    - **Yes, this messaging will appear on the website, relevant collateral, and outreach talking points.**
  19. We need clear and factual message to explain what the contract with SMUD means. The explanation included in the website FAQs is an excellent response. We think this information could be utilized as part of overall messaging and not just on the website FAQ section.
    - **Yes, this messaging will appear on the updated website.**
  20. It would be beneficial to make it clear in the messaging (and throughout any public engagement activity) that VCEA is a transparent organization that values input from its customers. This could include, for example, plans to hold public forums once or twice a year in each of the member jurisdictions to receive input (and questions) from customers and provide information. Similar forums could also be held with different stakeholder groups (i.e., ag community, large industrial users, chambers of commerce).
    - **This messaging will appear on the website, relevant collateral, and outreach talking points. The public forums in each of the member jurisdictions and with different stakeholder groups is beyond Circlepoint's scope of work, but something we can add if approved by VCEA staff and the Board. The level of effort would be determined by the scale and number of the forums.**

21. Consider clarifying that VCEA will be “rate competitive” as opposed to using the term “affordable”, which is a relative term.
  - **Yes, that’s a good distinction. We will clarify that in our messaging.**
22. It is important to emphasize who we are, who comprises the staff and board and the competence of those who are governing, staffing and advising VCEA.
  - **Yes, this messaging will appear on the website, relevant collateral, and outreach talking points.**
23. The term, “For Yolo county, by Yolo county” does not work. VCEA is more than just Yolo County (see comment #1).
  - **Agreed. We will eliminate that message.**
24. In working with the agricultural community, it is important to work with the different segments of the ag community, such as food processing (which is also part of the industrial customer class).
  - **Noted. We will check with the ag organizations and SMUD key account reps regarding their recommendations for the different segments of the ag/industrial customers.**
25. The messaging options on page 6 seem a bit simplistic and more like tag lines. Key messaging for different stakeholder groups needs more depth and meat. We suggest that key messages for different groups should be vetted with those groups before rolling out to make sure the messages hit the mark. SMUD’s market research may have information to help with this.
  - **We are reworking the messaging framework based on this feedback. We are working with SMUD’s key account reps to gather any market insights they are willing to share for each group. They have agreed to provide example collateral/messaging for different market segments as a reference for us.**
26. It would be helpful to prepare information for existing and new solar customers about how VCEA relates to them. This would include information about existing contracts, NEM and future installations. It would be useful to provide this information not only to customers directly but also to the solar industry (i.e., companies and installers who operate in Davis, Woodland and unincorporated Yolo County).
  - **This messaging will appear on the website, relevant collateral, and outreach talking points.**
27. We like the phrase: “Cleaner Energy at Competitive Prices.”
  - **We’ll add this to our messaging framework.**



28. Are there lessons learned from outreach efforts of other CCA's that can help with VCEA's outreach efforts?

- **Yes, we developed our plan based on Circlepoint's experience with other CCAs. For Peninsula Clean Energy, they conducted multi-language focus groups that provided insights regarding messaging, advertising, and outreach strategies for different customer segments. These findings will inform their work for Valley Clean Energy. Leveraging advocates to help with outreach was another successful tactic from PCE that they're employing here.**

# Valley Clean Energy Alliance Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan Draft v4

## Table of Contents

- 1. *Introduction*..... **1**
- 2. *Goals and Objectives*..... **2**
- 3. *Key Issues and Challenges* ..... **2**
- 4. *Brand Creation*..... **3**
- 5. *Target Audiences* ..... **4**
- 6. *Messaging*..... **7**
- 7. *Communication Channels* ..... **11**
- 8. *Collaboration with VCEA Staff*..... **16**
- 9. *Timeline* ..... **16**
- 10. *Success Measurements*..... **18**

## Introduction

Valley Clean Energy Alliance (VCEA) is the Community Choice Energy (CCE) program that will serve as the default electricity service provider to all participating residents, businesses, and agricultural customers in Davis, Woodland, and unincorporated Yolo County. As a community governed power supplier, VCEA will empower residents and businesses with a choice in selecting who sources their electricity and what percentage of that power will come from clean sources. VCEA has hired Circlepoint, in collaboration with InterEthnica, to develop, launch, and manage a marketing, advertising, and communications campaign that will educate, inform, and raise awareness for the VCEA brand and its services for residents and businesses within VCEA’s service area.

The following Strategic Marketing and Communications Plan (plan) will serve as a roadmap for the implementation of a marketing program that provides service area residents, businesses, stakeholders, elected officials, and the general public with information about the operations and services provided by VCEA. The plan defines objectives, goals, issues and challenges, target audiences, messaging, communications channels, program timeline, and measurements of success.

The plan is intended to be a living document that will be assessed and refined as the campaign is implemented. The plan will also grow and mature alongside the VCEA brand to fit the evolving needs of its constituents.

## **Goals and Objectives**

The primary goal of the plan is to educate and inform the general public within the service area about VCEA and establish household recognition and trustworthiness for the VCEA brand in an effort to establish a successful program with minimal opt-outs.

The core objectives of the plan focus on building brand awareness and established public outreach, so that the brand is recognized by and viewed positively by county residents. VCEA participation and consumption of its sub-products means the local community is investing in clean energy, which will help reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and dependence on exhaustible energy sources. Additionally, establishment of a successful CCE program will allow VCEA to reinvest back into the local communities, which benefits the economy.

### **Specific goals and measurements for this plan include:**

1. Provide clear, accurate, and easily accessible program information
2. Establish the brand as a trustworthy source with recognition within the service area, especially among agricultural customers
3. Deliver clear and transparent messaging regarding electricity rates
4. Maintain an opt-out rate below 8% for the default energy product
5. Maximize the number of opt-ups
6. Strengthen brand awareness of the program prior to launch, including its sub-products
7. Promote personal and community ownership of renewable resources

## **Key Issues and Challenges**

CCE programs create customer choice where none existed before. As such, it is expected that there will be challenges with promoting the VCEA program. Key anticipated barriers to program

participation include:

1. **Undefined Costs and Rates Prior to Launch:** A program without final product rates can be more difficult to market versus a program with set rates. While estimated rates provide customers with an idea of energy costs, set rates are more advantageous and transparent, especially since rates may only be slightly cheaper or in-line with PG&E at the launch of the program.
2. **Lack of Brand Recognition:** VCEA is a new program with little to no brand recognition within the area it will serve. Establishing the VCEA brand, and casting the brand in a positive light, will be a key challenge leading up to the launch of the program.

Circlepoint's work with other operational CCEs has shown that additional concerns for many electricity customers include:

- **Trust**—"What's a government agency doing in the electricity business?" Focusing on the aspect of not-for-profit and community control has proven to be key to developing trust and surmounting initial suspicion.
- **Cost**—"How much more will it cost me to buy greener electricity?" Looking issues of cost directly in the eye, even when it's not necessarily to the program's advantage (as may sometimes be the case) is always the best policy. Ultimately, honesty about these issues will earn trust in the brand.
- **Value**—"I know that renewable electricity is better than fossil-fuel-based electricity, but if it costs more I'm not sure it's worth it to me." Addressing bigger-picture issues of the *true* cost of fossil fuels, while retaining relevance to the everyday concerns of people, requires a balanced strategic approach to communication.

This Plan addresses these key issues and other barriers to participation by establishing an overall outreach strategy implemented through specific outreach actions.

## Brand Creation

### Creating a Brand for Customer Understanding

Circlepoint will develop a fully-realized brand, including a logo, which will help to visually tell the VCEA story. This brand creation will result in messaging that goes beyond education to convey benefits and create a brand experience that builds trust and shows that choice is, indeed, a benefit to the consumer. Additionally, the brand will connect VCEA with the customers that it serves. Branding efforts will ensure that the look and feel of all VCEA collateral remain consistent throughout the entirety of the program. This is especially critical during the pre-launch phase.

### **Naming Electricity Products (sub-branding)**

The creation of sub-brands will establish the different products available through VCEA and help further distinguish each product as a unique entity within the overarching VCEA brand. The names will be based on the overarching brand personality that has been established for VCEA, while suggesting appropriate “levels” to customers. While the product options and details have yet to be established, the naming options will be consist with a default product and a premium product. They will fit within the brand family in a logical and meaningful way, offering not just identifiers but a convenient shorthand for marketing communication.

All of the currently operational CCEs in the state of California have sub-brands for their product offerings, which fit both logically and visually within the overarching umbrella of their main brands. The product branding process will include the distillation of a few key, well-considered sub-brand options along with graphic representations for each that fit with the overall brand and program goals.

### **Target Audiences**

The cities of Davis, Woodland and unincorporated Yolo County have a diverse population with a variety of cultural backgrounds, ages, education and income levels. In order to establish effective communications, it is essential to define target audiences to help inform key messaging. The diverse population creates a variety of motivations for potential VCEA customers, ranging from economic impact to environmental sustainability. In many cases, different groups share basic concerns, but each may have its own specific perspective. The Plan maps out the diversity of target audiences:

1. General Residential Customers/PG&E customers
2. Commercial/industrial/business, with focus on agricultural audiences
3. Multicultural audiences
4. Advocates, champions, and early adopters
5. Seniors
6. Solar customers
7. Low income residents
8. City and county chambers of commerce
9. Unincorporated areas and neighborhood groups
10. Elected officials

For more information about the target audiences, their unique motivations, and the preliminary tailored messages, see the Messaging Framework in section 6 of this document.

## **Agricultural Communications and Outreach**

Agricultural and rural customer communications and outreach will be critical to the success of VCEA. The agricultural audience is seen as a large customer class with specific needs that are unique to the VCEA service area. Establishing trustworthiness is of particular importance to this group. We anticipate that the single most important message that this audience will be interested in is cost. For those seeking to reduce their costs, Circlepoint will provide information on rates that clearly conveys that rates meet the goal of cost competitiveness (or better), than those offered by the incumbent utility provider.

By recognizing VCEA services may not be especially suitable for certain ag businesses, tailored materials will communicate about the potential concerns of and potential barriers for this audience, while emphasizing the benefits that align with their unique needs and motivations. Another key point to emphasize with this audience is that VCEA will be a better, more reliable partner. As a complement to the messages around program costs and reliability, messaging will highlight the local control aspect of CCE.

Circlepoint will make a special effort to reach agricultural audiences throughout program launch by reaching them where they are and through their preferred channels. The team will work with the VCEA Advisory Committee and VCEA staff to identify trusted partners, such as the Yolo County Farm Bureau, in order to reach this customer group effectively. The team will also get input from other industry organizations such as **cattlemen's associations, organic farmers and small farm operations**. Input from all of these sources will inform the best approach to engaging these customers, and the draft messaging. These trusted sources will also help identify members of the local ag community who may become brand champions. These champions may be interested in being featured in our advertising campaign and help us increase brand awareness through word of mouth.

Circlepoint will also develop custom collateral like an agricultural customer toolkit that is tailored to the key concerns and interests of this important customer group. The toolkit will emphasize program cost savings, local control, and local benefits and will serve as a tool to help develop brand champions who can help spread the word about VCEA. The toolkit will also include tailored information about enrollment, cost and rates, potential savings data, and FAQs.

## **Multicultural Communications and Outreach**

VCEA is committed to providing support and resources for customers for whom English might be a second language. Due to the diversity of the service area's population, all messaging, notices, advertising, and marketing must be multilingual. In Yolo County, the population aged 5 and older who speak a language other than English at home is 64,337 persons, which represents 35% of the population.. This rate is less than the state rate of 43%. Of these languages other than English spoken at home, Spanish represents nearly 60% in the VCEA service territory. Knowing that there is a large percentage of the population who prefer Spanish-

language, collateral that includes pertinent information about VCEA services will be developed to include Spanish language to maximize efficiency and amplify customer education.

Circlepoint and InterEthnica will work together to develop tailored marketing and outreach materials for target audiences of all ethnic and socioeconomic backgrounds. The team will create culturally appropriate messaging in-language that will resonate with each audience, building authenticity and trust.

For non-English speakers, Circlepoint will produce materials translated in multiple languages. Materials will include clear graphics, for audiences who may have limited reading abilities in their own language. Informational materials for multi-cultural communications and outreach will also include English, because many of the county's non-English speakers, as well as those persons that are Limited English Proficient (LEP), demonstrate a measurable understanding and familiarity with English. Therefore, the inclusion of English on all materials gives the LEP and bilingual residents the ability to cross-reference information in two languages. This approach is especially valuable to bilingual persons for two reasons:

1. Bilingual persons born in the U.S. who use their first language primarily at home are often accustomed to using English outside of the home.
2. Many non-English speakers do not trust the quality of translated text and feel reassured when they cross-reference information with written English text that they may understand just as well.

In addition to in-language advertising strategies, Circlepoint will employ grassroots engagement tactics to reach multicultural populations within the service area, such as partnering with religious and social-service institutions to reach these audiences through trusted channels. The team will distribute materials through community-based organizations and in public locations where audiences may turn to services such as check cashing locations, laundromats, and grocery stores,

The Yolo County Housing Authority could be a potential partner for materials distribution as the work with low income and affordable housing agencies. Because audiences already seek the help and resources of the agency, this partnership would be a key authority to distribute messaging and inform about VCEA.

The team will also engage the various ethnic chambers of commerce to frame participation in VCEA as the new status quo for sustainable businesses. This will provide an opportunity to request that businesses promote the program on their websites, social channels, and other communications platforms.

Call Center scripting and training will also be developed to support VCEA’s bi-lingual objectives. In addition, the selected SMUD Call Center services support non-English speaking customers (multi-lingual).

## Messaging

Overall Messaging Options:

1. Cleaner energy at competitive prices.
2. We have the power. Independent, local energy.
3. Our community. Our power. Our choice.
4. Rates you can depend on.
5. The grass is greener when the energy is cleaner.
6. See more green when you switch to clean.

The draft messages listed below touch on the topics that the specific audiences care about. These messages speak to their motivations and what will resonate. The messaging framework below will help to inform future collateral development, advertising, and other outreach materials.

Messaging Framework		
Audience	Key Motivations	Preliminary Sub-messages
General Audience/Customers at large/PG&E customers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Environmental health</li> <li>● Reliability</li> <li>● Cost</li> <li>● Choice</li> <li>● Local control</li> <li>● Not for Profit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Valley Clean Energy is bringing cleaner energy at competitive rates to residents and businesses in Davis, Woodland, and unincorporated Yolo County.</li> <li>● VCE provides an alternative to PG&amp;E and gives our member communities a choice in how much of our electricity comes from renewable sources.</li> <li>● VCEA offers clean, affordable energy you can count on.</li> <li>● Choosing VCEA means cleaner energy at competitive rates provided by a local not for profit committed to returning value to our communities.</li> <li>● Investing in clean energy is an investment in our community’s</li> </ul>



		<p>future.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The choices we make now impact future generations. Choose clean, renewable energy for a healthier Yolo County.</li> </ul>
<p>Agricultural and rural customers/ unincorporated areas and neighborhood groups</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost</li> <li>• Reliability</li> <li>• Environmental health</li> <li>• Choice</li> <li>• Local control</li> <li>• Better partner</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• With the support of agricultural leaders like you, we can work together to help make the cities of Davis, Woodland, and unincorporated areas of Yolo County a better place for the industry to thrive. Valley Clean Energy will provide locally controlled, clean electricity at competitive rates and will be the official electricity provider for all energy customers in Davis, Woodland, and unincorporated areas of Yolo County.</li> <li>• Cleaner energy is more affordable than you think. Valley Clean Energy offers clean, affordable energy you can count on.</li> <li>• Valley Clean Energy is a better partner for local agriculture. Community energy means cost competitive, stable rates.</li> <li>• Valley Clean Energy is good for our community and the economy by bringing you a local choice for your clean power.</li> </ul>
<p>Champions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Leading by example</li> <li>• Environmental health</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Thanks for helping lead the charge against climate change! Your help will bring clean energy to our communities and will help create local, renewable jobs!</li> <li>• Help our community exceed our clean energy goals.</li> <li>• Choosing VCE's 100% renewable energy option is an easy way to contribute to greenhouse gas reduction and a more sustainable Yolo County. With this option,</li> </ul>

		<p>100% of your electricity supply will be sourced from clean, not-for-profit energy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interested in helping us get the word out about Valley Clean Energy? Become a VCE champion!</li> </ul>
Seniors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Impact on future generations</li> <li>Leading by example</li> <li>Trust</li> <li>Cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Valley Clean Energy offers clean, affordable local energy you can count on.</li> <li>It's time we had a choice. Clean energy is coming to your neighborhood.</li> <li>Make a difference for future generations. Choose local sustainable energy.</li> </ul>
Solar customers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cost</li> <li>Choice</li> <li>Maintenance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Harness your solar power for additional savings. Valley Clean Energy's net energy metering program allows customers with rooftop solar panels on their home or business get the full retail value of the electricity their system generates. When your panels produce more electricity than you use, you receive a credit on your bill.</li> <li>If you need additional electricity when the skies are gray, Valley Clean Energy is here for you with affordable, reliable clean energy</li> <li>We know you care about the environment. Valley Clean Energy provides cleaner energy at competitive prices.</li> </ul>
Low income residents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cost</li> <li>Retention of CARE/FERA programs</li> <li>Stable rates</li> <li>Health (Low-income communities)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>You don't have to pay more for clean energy. If you're enrolled in any of PG&amp;E's discount programs, you will continue to get your discounts with Valley Clean Energy. There's no need to reapply for: California Alternative Rates for Energy (CARE), Federal</li> </ul>

	<p>traditionally have larger numbers of people suffering from asthma)</p>	<p>Electric Rate Assistance (FERA), Medical Baseline Allowance (MBA) and the Low Income Home Energy Assistance Program (LIHEAP). You'll continue to receive these rate discounts once you're automatically enrolled, with the added benefit of receiving cleaner electricity at even lower rates.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Make the local choice for clean energy without the extra cost. Valley Clean Energy offers clean, affordable local energy you can count on, and your cost savings contributes to your local economy.</li> </ul>
<p>Commercial/industrial/business /chambers of commerce</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost</li> <li>• Local focus</li> <li>• Reducing pollution</li> <li>• Reputation among socially conscious customer groups</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Valley Clean Energy offers a local choice for cost competitive, clean energy your business can rely on.</li> <li>• Valley Clean Energy is good for business. Your company will benefit from competitive rates, while helping your business meet sustainability goals. You'll also be helping stimulates the health of the local economy and environment.</li> <li>• Your community is counting on you. Power your business with clean energy from Valley Clean Energy. When you support clean, local energy, you support economic growth in our communities. Earnings will help fund local economic development with green energy projects and energy efficiency programs.</li> </ul>
<p>Elected officials</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serving constituents needs/desires</li> <li>• Local focus</li> <li>• Impact on future generations</li> <li>• Cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Valley Clean Energy is the most efficient route to reduced GHGs and meeting our communities' climate action goals. When you support clean, local energy, you support economic growth in your County.</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Meeting climate goals set by CA governor</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A cleaner future is a greener future. Valley Clean Energy offers clean, local energy for sustainable growth in your County. The choices we make now impact future generations. Choose clean energy for a healthier tomorrow..</li> <li>• Clean energy is the future. Support Valley Clean Energy to help lead your county into a bright economic future.</li> </ul>
--	--	--

## Communication Channels

Messaging and public outreach are only effective when the target audiences receive the messages that are intended for them. Today, market segmentation means a diverse audience receives messages from a variety of mediums, through a range of channels. In order to maximize reach, Circlepoint will employ a wide variety of communications channels to raise awareness and enhance brand recognition for VCEA. Leveraging existing communications channels and other resources help to maximize efficiency.

The Plan outlines the following communications channels:

Media	Materials	Implementation
Program Collateral	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Business toolkit</li> <li>• Agricultural toolkit</li> <li>• Senior Buddy training guide</li> <li>• Animated video</li> <li>• Factsheets</li> <li>• Brochures</li> <li>• Poster</li> <li>• Flyers</li> <li>• Banner</li> <li>• Window cling</li> <li>• FAQs</li> <li>• PowerPoint template</li> <li>• Customer enrollment notices</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Distribute collateral at tabling during community events and through community organizations.</li> <li>• Print collateral will be created in a bilingual format.</li> <li>• Distribute noticing by mail, per the requirements outlined in the outreach and communications plan. Distribute/post posters and postcards in public locations, such as libraries, City/County facilities, senior centers, and veteran centers</li> <li>• Develop tailored marketing and outreach materials for non-English speaking customers</li> </ul>

Website	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Translations</li> <li>● Rates pages</li> <li>● Rates calculator</li> <li>● Media page</li> <li>● Opt-in/out content</li> <li>● Sign-up forms</li> <li>● Enrollment maps</li> <li>● Partner website badge</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Employ bilingual site in English and Spanish</li> <li>● Conduct website audit</li> <li>● Implement site enhancements including social media integration, rate calculator, and a progress tracker</li> <li>● Include testimonials from opinion leaders from all three jurisdictions and different stakeholder groups as good way to provide positive messaging about Valley Clean Energy and hopefully answer questions residents and businesses may have about the program.</li> </ul>
Email Marketing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Email templates</li> <li>● Content and graphics</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Distribute informational content through VCEA's existing listserv email database. Add new email addresses through social media campaigns, a sign up option on the VCEA website and at tabling events.</li> <li>● Develop regularly scheduled email blasts.</li> </ul>
Advertising	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Print</li> <li>● Radio</li> <li>● Transit</li> <li>● Digital</li> <li>● Outdoor</li> <li>● Social media</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● See media plan.</li> </ul>
Social Media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Social media graphics</li> <li>● Editorial content</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Develop the following social media accounts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Facebook</li> <li>● Twitter</li> <li>● YouTube</li> <li>● LinkedIn</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Develop and post relevant content on VCEA social media pages by creating an editorial calendar for timely and regular posts.</li> <li>● Engage via NextDoor</li> </ul>
Events and	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Develop list of events,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Attend pertinent community and</li> </ul>

In-person Outreach	<p>neighborhood, and stakeholder meetings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Attend or “piggyback” on existing community events, such as farmers markets. Community events will be determined.</li> <li>● Program Collateral</li> </ul>	<p>stakeholder meetings, events</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Use events as an opportunity to distribute informational material, collect input, gather email addresses and engage the public.</li> <li>● Engage CAC members to support in-person outreach.</li> <li>● Engage community organizations to support in-person outreach.</li> </ul>
Earned media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Press kit</li> <li>● Press releases</li> <li>● Op-eds and news articles</li> <li>● Multicultural media</li> <li>● Ongoing media outreach</li> <li>● Speakers Bureau with Board Members</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Engage local media, specialized media and community bloggers for earned placement as identified in the outreach and communications plan.</li> <li>● Develop news alerts and press releases for key milestones, human interest stories and other unique and interesting aspects of VCEA.</li> <li>● Celebrate successes.</li> <li>● Conduct outreach to ethnic media</li> </ul>
Call Center Scripting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Call center script</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Develop script for call center agents.</li> </ul>
On-call tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● VCEA board presentations</li> <li>● Planning calls</li> <li>● Reporting</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● In addition to providing VCEA board with marketing and outreach updates, Circlepoint will compile regular progress, tracking, and reports</li> </ul>

### Stakeholder Outreach

Outreach to local neighborhood and community groups, business groups, and elected officials is essential to identify and engage program champions and seed natural dissemination of program awareness into communities served by VCEA. This is the best opportunity for VCEA Board Members to get involved and help build and empower those champions.

For special customer classes, such as large commercial, industrial and solar customers, SMUD’s key account reps will provide input on messaging and review draft materials to ensure materials as tailored effectively for these customers.

### In-Person Meetings/Presentations

Circlepoint, VCEA staff, and trained advocates will reach out to the community groups and centers listed below and make presentations during their normally scheduled meetings and/or

activity sessions. In the event that a VCEA board member would like to attend the meeting and present on behalf of the program, Circlepoint will prepare talking points to ensure the member has adequate information for a successful presentation. Initial outreach to these organizations will also serve as an opportunity to vet our tailored messaging and materials for their audiences.

Dates for each meeting will be scheduled as the program gets closer to public advertising in early 2018.

These groups will include:

CBOs	Agencies/Organizations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● VCEA Advisory Committee</li> <li>● Capay Valley Advisory Committee</li> <li>● Clarksburg General Plan Advisory Committee</li> <li>● South Davis General Plan Advisory Committee</li> <li>● Yolo-Zamora Advisory Committee Churches</li> <li>● Davis Joint Unified School District</li> <li>● Woodland Joint unified School District</li> <li>● Esparto Unified School District</li> <li>● UC Davis</li> <li>● Woodland Noon Rotary</li> <li>● Woodland Sunrise Rotary</li> <li>● Davis Noon Rotary</li> <li>● Davis Sunrise Rotary</li> <li>● Davis Sunset Rotary</li> <li>● Kiwanis Davis</li> <li>● Woodland Kiwanis Club</li> <li>● Clergy and congregations, including ecumenical and inter-faith groups</li> <li>●</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● County service areas               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <u>Dunnigan CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>El Macero CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>Garcia Bend CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>North Davis Meadows CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>Snowball CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>Wild Wings CSA</u></li> <li>○ <u>Willowbank CSA</u></li> </ul> </li> <li>● Yolo County Farm Bureau</li> <li>● Yolo County Housing Authority</li> <li>● Yolo Flood and Irrigation District</li> <li>● Davis Downtown Business Association</li> <li>● Historic Woodland Downtown Business Association</li> <li>● Woodland Chamber of Commerce</li> <li>● Davis Chamber of Commerce</li> <li>● California Hispanic Chambers of Commerce</li> <li>● Local environmental groups (i.e., Davis, Woodland Sierra Club; Cool Davis, Audubon)</li> </ul>

### Phone Calls and Material Distribution

For groups where it is impractical or not possible to meet with in person, we will call them to discuss VCEA over the phone, and email materials for leaders to distribute to their groups. This outreach will occur at the same time as the group meetings listed above, to complement that work.

These groups will include:

CBOs	Agencies	Ag industry	Businesses/
------	----------	-------------	-------------

		<b>organizations</b>	<b>associations</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Soroptimists International of Woodland</li> <li>• Capay Valley Vision</li> <li>• Woodland Community College</li> <li>• League of Women Voters of Woodland</li> <li>• Yolo County Office of Education</li> <li>• Los Rios Community College District</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unions/ Central Labor Council</li> <li>• Operating Engineers Local 39</li> <li>• Carpenters Local Union</li> <li>• Clarksburg Fire District</li> <li>• Yolo Emergency Communications Agency</li> <li>• Woodland-Davis Clean Water Agency</li> <li>• Richard Heath and Associates (RHA)</li> <li>• Yolo Flood and Irrigation District</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Organic Farmers</li> <li>• Full Belly</li> <li>• Pacific Coast Producers</li> <li>• Seed Co's</li> <li>• Yolo Land Trust</li> <li>• Farm Fresh to You</li> <li>• Farm Circle</li> <li>• PTAs in all jurisdictions</li> <li>• Yolo Energy Watch and participating groups</li> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yolo County Visitor Bureau</li> <li>• Clark Pacific</li> <li>• Target Distribution Center</li> <li>• Rite Aid Distribution Center</li> <li>• Hotels</li> <li>• Davis Rental Housing Association</li> <li>• Hospitals</li> <li>• Local realtor's associations</li> <li>• Local apartment associations</li> <li>• Senior citizen organizations</li> <li>• Mobile home associations (both coach owners if they pay electricity and/or park owners for master metered parks)</li> </ul>

### Media Plan

Our proposed media plan includes a robust effort - 18 weeks of advertising, from March to June 2018, to reach audiences across Yolo County about the VCEA program roll-out.

We will run preliminary digital ads in order to test messaging and graphics and to grow our following on Facebook. We will use the ads that perform the best to launch our full media buys. With additional funding, we can extend the length of the advertising buy and add additional channels.



We will create a full media plan with a matrix of media buys as we get closer to the advertising launch date.

## Collaboration with VCEA Staff

Based on their experience with other CCEs, Circlepoint has provided the full suite of marketing and communications services as the programs gradually build their staff. Once CCEs have more in-house marketing resources, such as a Director of Marketing or Marketing Manager, Key Account Rep, and Outreach Associates or Interns, the in-house team typically leads specific activities, such as direct customer engagement and outreach. Circlepoint has continued to be agency support to them, providing communications strategy, advertising, graphic design, and web maintenance services. The Plan envisions a similar transition here, and the Circlepoint team will continue to support VCEA staff through the process.

## Project Timeline

In addition to the below timeline, a more detailed document will be developed to outline the outreach activities and the specific dates/responsibilities to track when in-person meetings will take place and who is assigned to them.

Task	Deliverables	Timing
<b>Communications and outreach plan</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Final communications and outreach plan</li> <li>● Messaging framework</li> </ul>	September 2017 - October 2017
<b>Program Branding, Design, Identity</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● VCEA logo</li> <li>● Sub-product(s) and program name</li> <li>● Sub-product(s) and program logo</li> <li>● Branding guidelines</li> <li>● Business toolkit</li> <li>● Agricultural customer toolkit</li> <li>● Senior buddy training guide</li> <li>● Animated video</li> <li>● Factsheets (2)</li> <li>● Brochures (2)</li> <li>● Poster</li> <li>● Flyers (2)</li> </ul>	September 2017 - January 2018

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Banner</li> <li>● Window cling</li> <li>● FAQs (2)</li> <li>● PowerPoint template</li> </ul>	
<b>Website</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Content development</li> <li>● Sitemap and wireframes</li> <li>● Visual mockups</li> <li>● Rates pages</li> <li>● Media Page</li> <li>● Social media integration</li> <li>● Opt-up, Opt-out, Early adopter pages</li> <li>● Sign-up forms</li> <li>● Progress tracker</li> <li>● Rate calculator</li> <li>● Abbreviated page translations in Spanish language</li> </ul>	<p>Phase 1 Launch – November</p> <p>Phase 2 Launch – April 1</p>
<b>Program Outreach Support</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Outreach toolkit</li> <li>● In-person engagement</li> <li>● List of in-person engagement opportunities</li> <li>● Email newsletter engagement</li> <li>● Monthly written content and images</li> <li>● Support efforts and training</li> <li>● Two (2) trainings for advocates</li> <li>● Branded giveaway items</li> <li>● Booth/tabling event banners</li> </ul>	<p>September 2017 – May 2018</p>
<b>Pre-launch Marketing Campaign</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Comprehensive and multi-lingual paid advertising campaign</li> <li>● Advertising campaign artwork</li> <li>● Photography shoot</li> <li>● Stakeholder/partner network communications</li> </ul>	<p>September 2017 – June 2018</p>

<b>Social media</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Establish social media accounts for Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, and LinkedIn</li> <li>• Create monthly calendar of social media posts</li> </ul>	November 2017 – June 2018
<b>Media Planning and Buying</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Advertising media plan</li> <li>• Secure advertising placements</li> </ul>	November 2017 – March 2018
<b>Media Relations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mainstream and multicultural media relations</li> <li>• Press kit</li> <li>• Up to three (3) press releases</li> </ul>	April 2018 – June 2018
<b>Customer Notification</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development, design and delivery of four (4) opt-out notifications sent via USPS mail</li> </ul>	November 2017 – July 2018
<b>Call center scripting</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• One (1) final call center script</li> </ul>	November 2017 – December 2017
<b>On-call and As-Needed Tasks</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Up to four (4) VCEA Board presentations</li> <li>• As-need and/or regular project team calls</li> </ul>	August 2017 – June 2018

## Success Measurements

These quantitative measurements will serve as the barometer for the effectiveness of the campaign:

1. Residential opt-out rate
2. Business opt-out rate
3. Residential and business opt-up rate
4. Social media followers
5. Social media conversations, engagement, and viral spread
6. Website traffic, usage, and patterns

7. Email sign-ups and engagement
8. Attendance at meetings and events
9. Advertising reach, impressions, and effectiveness
10. Media coverage

Throughout the life of the campaign, Circlepoint will engage in ongoing tracking and evaluation and create reports with both detailed and summary information. In addition, Circlepoint will utilize SMUD outreach resources as a “sounding board” to provide an additional expert perspective on key VCEA outreach actions and activities. Tracking and reporting these indicators on a frequent and regular basis will enable the team to make adjustments to strategies, tactics, and messages during the campaign.

## VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE

### Staff Report Item - 8

---

**TO:** VCEA Community Advisory Committee  
**FROM:** Mitch Sears, Interim General Manager, VCEA  
**SUBJECT:** VCEA Vision Statement  
**DATE:** November 6, 2017

---

#### **Recommendation**

Consider feedback on draft VCEA Vision Statement. Revise draft Vision Statement if necessary and recommend Board adoption.

#### **Analysis and Discussion**

The Vision Statement was developed by the Vision Statement sub-committee and presented to the Advisory Committee for discussion at the September 27 meeting.

#### **Attachment**

1. VCEA draft Vision Statement

## Valley Clean Energy Alliance

### Integrated Vision for Community Choice Energy

Valley Clean Energy Alliance (VCEA) is a joint-powers authority working to implement a state-authorized Community Choice Energy (CCE) program. Participating VCEA governments include the City of Davis, the City of Woodland and County of Yolo. The purpose of the VCEA is to enable the participating jurisdictions to determine the sources, modes of production and costs of the electricity they procure for the residential, commercial, agricultural and industrial users in their areas. PG&E would continue to deliver the electricity procured by VCEA and perform billing, metering, and other electric distribution utility functions and services. Customers within the participating jurisdictions would have the choice of whether or not to participate in the VCEA program.

#### Near-Term Vision

The near-term vision for VCEA is to provide electricity users with greater choice over the sources and prices of the electricity they use, by:

- Offering basic electricity service with higher renewable electricity content, at a rate competitive with PG&E;
- Developing and offering additional low-carbon or local generation options at modest price premiums;
- Establishing an energy planning framework for developing local energy efficiency programs and local energy resources and infrastructure; and
- Accomplishing the goals enumerated above while accumulating reserve funds for future VCEA energy programs and mitigation of future energy costs and risks.

#### Long -Term Vision

The future vision for VCEA is to continuously improve the electricity choices available to VCEA customers, while expanding local energy-related economic opportunities, by:

- Evaluating and adopting best practices of the electricity service industry for planning and operational management;
- Substantially increasing the renewable electricity content of basic electricity service, with the ultimate goal of achieving zero carbon emissions electricity;
- Developing and managing customized programs for energy efficiency, on-site electricity production and storage;
- Accelerating deployment of local energy resources to increase localized investment, employment, innovation and resilience;
- Working to achieve the climate action goals of participating jurisdictions to shape a sustainable energy

**Item 8**

Rev. 4 – September 27, 2017

future; and

- Saving money for ratepayers on their energy bills.
- Remaining open to the participation of additional jurisdictions.

# Valley Clean Energy Alliance

## Integrated Vision for Community Choice Energy

Valley Clean Energy Alliance (VCEA) is a joint-powers authority working to implement a state-authorized Community Choice Energy (CCE) program. Participating VCEA governments include the City of Davis, the City of Woodland and County of Yolo. The purpose of the VCEA is to enable the participating jurisdictions to determine the sources, modes of production and costs of the electricity they procure for the residential, commercial, agricultural and industrial users in their areas. PG&E would continue to deliver the electricity procured by VCEA and perform billing, metering, and other electric distribution utility functions and services. Customers within the participating jurisdictions would have the choice of whether or not to participate in the VCEA program.

### Near-Term Vision

The near-term vision for VCEA is to provide electricity users with greater choice over the sources and prices of the electricity they use, by:

- Offering basic electricity service with higher renewable electricity content, at a rate competitive with PG&E;
- Developing and offering additional low-carbon or local generation options at modest price premiums;
- Establishing an energy planning framework for developing local energy efficiency programs and local energy resources and infrastructure; and
- Accomplishing the goals enumerated above while accumulating reserve funds for future VCEA energy programs and mitigation of future energy costs and risks.

### Long -Term Vision

The future vision for VCEA is to continuously improve the electricity choices available to VCEA customers, while expanding local energy-related economic opportunities, by:

- Evaluating and adopting best practices of the electricity service industry for planning and operational management;
- Substantially increasing the renewable electricity content of basic electricity service, with the ultimate goal of achieving zero carbon emissions electricity;
- Developing and managing customized programs for energy efficiency, on-site electricity production and storage;
- Accelerating deployment of local energy resources to increase localized investment, employment, innovation and resilience;
- Working to achieve the climate action goals of participating jurisdictions to shape a sustainable energy future; and
- Saving money for ratepayers on their energy bills.
- Remaining open to the participation of additional jurisdictions.



## VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY ALLIANCE

### Staff Report Item - 9

---

**TO:** VCEA Community Advisory Committee

**FROM:** Mitch Sears, Interim General Manager, VCEA

**SUBJECT:** Updated Load Forecast and Introduction of Procurement Approach

**DATE:** November 6, 2017

---

#### **Recommendation**

Receive presentation from SMUD.

#### **Background and Analysis**

SMUD will provide background information on several topics related to power procurement as outlined below. The purpose of this agenda item is to update the CAC and set the stage for recommendations by the CAC at its next meeting.

Presentation topics:

- **Load Forecast.** SMUD has completed its evaluation of detailed customer PG&E load data, and has developed VCEA's Load Forecast. This is the forecast that will be used for actual power procurement activities and revenue forecasts. We'll review data used for inputs into the forecast, and will present the methodology. Results will be presented for review and discussion.
- **Power Procurement Process.** SMUD will provide an overview of the power procurement process and the timing of anticipated power procurements.
- **Resource Portfolio Alternative.** The CAC has requested that SMUD run an additional resource mix scenario for a 42% renewable resource supply. SMUD made that run and has incorporated it into the updated VCEA Financial Model. The updated VCEA Financial Model has current assumptions for PCIA for 2018 and beyond. (The PCIA in 2018 will be greater than assumed). The Financial impact of the new resource scenario is compared with the financial impact of the other scenarios developed for the Implementation Plan.
- **Wholesale Power Procurement & Risk Management Policy Highlights (Agenda Item 10).** The procurement and risk policy will establish the commodity Risk Management program for VCEA. It will establish Risk Management functions and procedures for managing the risks associated with power procurement activities. SMUD will present an overview of the key elements of the Risk Management policies for discussion.

## Power Mix Detail – All of California

**2016**

Fuel Type	California In-State Generation (GWh)	Percent of California In-State Generation	Northwest Imports (GWh)	Southwest Imports (GWh)	California Energy Mix (GWh)	California Power Mix
<b>Coal</b>	324	<b>0.16%</b>	373	11,310	12,006	<b>4.13%</b>
<b>Large Hydro</b>	24,410	<b>12.31%</b>	3,367	1,904	29,681	<b>10.21%</b>
<b>Natural Gas</b>	98,831	<b>49.86%</b>	41	7,120	105,992	<b>36.48%</b>
<b>Nuclear</b>	18,931	<b>9.55%</b>	0	7,739	26,670	<b>9.18%</b>
<b>Oil</b>	37	<b>0.02%</b>	0	0	37	<b>0.01%</b>
<b>Other (Petroleum Coke/Waste Heat)</b>	394	<b>0.20%</b>	0	0	394	<b>0.14%</b>
<b>Renewables</b>	55,300	<b>27.90%</b>	11,710	6,952	73,961	<b>25.45%</b>
<b>Biomass</b>	5,868	<b>2.96%</b>	659	25	6,553	<b>2.26%</b>
<b>Geothermal</b>	11,582	<b>5.84%</b>	96	1,038	12,717	<b>4.38%</b>
<b>Small Hydro</b>	4,567	<b>2.30%</b>	229	1	4,796	<b>1.65%</b>
<b>Solar</b>	19,783	<b>9.98%</b>	0	3,791	23,574	<b>8.11%</b>
<b>Wind</b>	13,500	<b>6.81%</b>	10,725	2,097	26,321	<b>9.06%</b>
<b>Unspecified Sources of Power</b>	N/A	<b>N/A</b>	26,888	14,937	41,825	<b>14.39%</b>
<b>Total</b>	198,227	<b>100.00%</b>	42,378	49,963	290,567	<b>100.00%</b>

[http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity\\_data/total\\_system\\_power.html](http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity_data/total_system_power.html)

Unspecified sources of power" means electricity from transactions that are not traceable to specific generation sources.

Large hydro > 30 MW, Small hydro < 30MW

## Power Mix Comparison – PGE, SMUD, CA

**2016**

Fuel Type	PG&E	SMUD	Percent of California In-State Generation	California Power Mix
<b>Coal</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>0.16%</b>	<b>4.13%</b>
<b>Large Hydro</b>	<b>12%</b>	<b>23%</b>	<b>12.31%</b>	<b>10.21%</b>
<b>Natural Gas</b>	<b>17%</b>	<b>41%</b>	<b>49.86%</b>	<b>36.48%</b>
<b>Nuclear</b>	<b>24%</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>9.55%</b>	<b>9.18%</b>
<b>Oil</b>			<b>0.02%</b>	<b>0.01%</b>
<b>Other (Petroleum Coke/Waste Heat)</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>0.20%</b>	<b>0.14%</b>
<b>Renewables</b>	<b>33%</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>27.90%</b>	<b>25.45%</b>
<b>Biomass</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>11%</b>	<b>2.96%</b>	<b>2.26%</b>
<b>Geothermal</b>	<b>5%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>5.84%</b>	<b>4.38%</b>
<b>Small Hydro</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>2.30%</b>	<b>1.65%</b>
<b>Solar</b>	<b>13%</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>9.98%</b>	<b>8.11%</b>
<b>Wind</b>	<b>8%</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>6.81%</b>	<b>9.06%</b>
<b>Unspecified Sources of Power*</b>	<b>14%</b>	<b>16%</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>14.39%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100.00%</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

[http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity\\_data/total\\_system\\_power.html](http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity_data/total_system_power.html) <https://www.smud.org/assets/documents/pdf/Power-Content-Label-full.pdf> [https://www.pge.com/pge\\_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE\\_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf](https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf)

Unspecified sources of power" means electricity from transactions that are not traceable to specific generation sources.

C.K. Shewmaker 10/30/17

## Power Mix Comparison – Some CCEs, PGE, CA

**2016**

Fuel Type	MCE Light Green	MCE Dark Green	PCE EcoPlus 2017 est.	SCP Clean Start	PG&E	California Power Mix
Coal	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	4%
Large Hydro	13%	0%	30%	49%	12%	10%
Natural Gas	12%	0%	0%	0%	17%	37%
Nuclear	0%	0%	0%	0%	24%	9%
Oil						>0.1%
Other (Petroleum Coke/Waste Heat)	0%		0%	0%	0%	>0.2%
<b>Renewables</b>	<b>55%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>42%</b>	<b>33%</b>	<b>25%</b>
Biomass	5%	25%	3%	0%	4%	2%
Geothermal	0%	0%	3%	8%	5%	4%
Small Hydro	7% %	0%	13%	2%	3%	2%
Solar	9%	25%	3%	0%	13%	8%
Wind	34%	50%	28%	31%	8%	9%
Unspecified Sources of Power*	19%	0%	20%	10%	14%	15%
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>		<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

[http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity\\_data/total\\_system\\_power.html](http://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/electricity_data/total_system_power.html)
[https://www.pge.com/pge\\_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE\\_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf](https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf)  
[https://www.mcccleanenergy.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/2016\\_Power\\_Content\\_Label\\_6x9\\_final-Website.pdf](https://www.mcccleanenergy.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/2016_Power_Content_Label_6x9_final-Website.pdf)  
[https://sonomacleanpower.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Copy-of-CA-Mix\\_Template2016.pdf](https://sonomacleanpower.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Copy-of-CA-Mix_Template2016.pdf)

Unspecified sources of power" means electricity from transactions that are not traceable to specific generation sources.

**Key Metrics of Operational CCA Programs in PG&E Territory**  
(As of October 2017)

Program Information	PG&E	MCE	SCP	PCE	CPSF	SVCE	RCEA
Current Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) (2016)	25%	25%	25%	25%	25%	25%	25%
Renewable content % - default product (2016)	33%*	55%	42%	50%	40%	50%	42%
Default product (% carbon free)	69%*	68% <sup>1</sup>	91%	80%	78%	100%	82%
Average monthly customer usage - E1 residential (kWh)		451	497	423	267	462	574
Average monthly customer usage - A1 non-residential (kWh)		1,272	1,491	1,574	1,499	2,236	967
100% renewable product - energy source	100% Solar	50% Wind, 25% Biomass/Waste, 25% Solar	100% Geothermal	53% Wind, 26% Hydro, 7% Solar, 7% Biomass, 7% Geo	100% wind	80% Wind, 20% Solar	44% Solar, 44% Wind, 12% Biomass
Incremental 100% Renewable Price (\$/kWh)	\$0.0261	\$0.010	\$0.025	\$0.010	\$0.020 Res, \$0.014 non-Res	\$0.008	\$0.010
Effective Date of Rates	June 1, 2017	June 1, 2017	March 1, 2017	March 15, 2017	January 1, 2017	April 1, 2017	June 1, 2017
Default product (residential-E1) - \$/kWh	\$ 0.09838	\$ 0.06800	\$ 0.06648	\$ 0.06369	\$ 0.07267	\$ 0.06763	\$ 0.06595
Default product (non-residential-A1) - \$/kWh	\$ 0.09764	\$ 0.07543	\$ 0.07294	\$ 0.07007	\$ 0.07740	\$ 0.07466	\$ 0.07223
Premium product (residential-E1) - \$/kWh	\$ 0.09529	\$ 0.78000	\$ 0.09148	\$ 0.07369	\$ 0.09267	\$ 0.07563	\$ 0.75950
Premium product (non-residential-A1) - \$/kWh	\$ 0.09236	\$ 0.08543	\$ 0.09794	\$ 0.08007	\$ 0.09740	\$ 0.08266	\$ 0.08223
PCIA (residential)		\$ 0.02977	\$ 0.02977	\$ 0.02977	\$ 0.02977	\$ 0.02977	\$ 0.02977
PCIA (non-residential)		\$ 0.02264	\$ 0.02264	\$ 0.02264	\$ 0.02264	\$ 0.02264	\$ 0.02264
Discount - PG&E vs. Residential default		< 1%	>2%	5%	4% higher than PG&E	1%	<3%
Discount - PG&E vs. Non-residential default		< 0.5% higher than PG&E	>2%	5%	2.4% higher than PG&E	< 1%	<3%
Link for Joint Rate Comparisons	<a href="https://www.pge.com/en_US/residential/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/community-choice-aggregation.page?WT.mc_id=Vanity_cca">https://www.pge.com/en_US/residential/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/community-choice-aggregation.page?WT.mc_id=Vanity_cca</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/mce_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/mce_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/scp_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/scp_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/pce_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/pce_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customer-service/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/cpsf_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customer-service/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/cpsf_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/svce_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/svce_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/rcea_rateclasscomparison.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/rcea_rateclasscomparison.pdf</a>
Link for Electric Power Mix Comparisons		<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/MCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/MCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/SCP_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customerservice/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/SCP_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/PCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customer-service/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/CPSF_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/myhome/customer-service/energychoice/communitychoiceaggregation/CPSF_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/SVCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/SVCE_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>	<a href="https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/RCEA_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf">https://www.pge.com/pge_global/common/pdfs/customer-service/other-services/alternative-energy-providers/community-choice-aggregation/RCEA_ElectricPowerGenerationMix.pdf</a>

**Notes**  
\* <http://www.pgecurrents.com/2017/03/16/nearly-70-percent-of-pge%E2%80%99s-electric-power-mix-free-of-greenhouse-gases/>

<sup>1</sup> Increases to 75% in 2017 per IRP